CONTENTS

Acknowledgments xii

Introduction 1

1 The global spread of proportionality and some analytical similarities with balancing 10

The spread of proportionality 10

Resistance to proportionality 14

Analytical similarities between balancing and proportionality 16

2 History 24

The origins of proportionality in German administrative law 24

Proportionality and *Rechtsstaat* 25

Judicial review and the development of the principle of proportionality 26

Proportionality, natural law, and formalism 28

Conclusion 32

The origins of balancing in American constitutional jurisprudence 32

Balancing as a critique of formalism and Langdellianism 33

Langdellianism 33

Balancing as anti-Langdellianism 34

Progressive balancing in constitutional law: balancing and anti-formalism in constitutional law 37

Lochnerism 37

Balancing as anti-Lochnerism 38

Progressive balancing during the McCarthy era 41

Conclusion 43

3 Culture 44

The German communitarian and organic conception of the state 44

Proportionality as an intrinsic element of the communitarian and organic conception of the state 49

The American individualistic and suspicion-based conception of the state 52

The suspicion-based conception of the state and balancing 57

Pragmatic versus conceptual balancing 58
Political culture and the expansiveness of rights 60

4 **Impact, intent, and indifference** 64
Impact-based and intent-based constitutional models: the ideal types 64
The European impact-based model 64
The American intent-based model 66
Impact-based and intent-based: exceptions 71
Intent-based: indifferent infringement of the Constitution 73
Two illustrations: *Minnesota* v. *Barber* and the indifferent bomber 73
Indifference in experimental philosophy: the Knobe Effect 76
Possible objections 78

5 **Epistemology** 82
Rules and standards in the USA 82
American epistemological skepticism 82
Epistemological skepticism and rules and standards 85
Epistemological skepticism and rules 85
Epistemological skepticism and standards: balancing and minimalism 87
European epistemological optimism 90
Epistemological optimism and standards 91
Proportionality and epistemological optimism 92
Balancing, proportionality, and control 94
Vertical and horizontal control 95
The size of the system and docket: America versus Israel 97
Supreme Court coherency 100

6 **Justification and authority** 103
A functional accounting for the spread of proportionality 104
Early legal development 104
Pluralism and conflict management 106
A global community of judges and *lingua franca* 109
Judicial power 110
Culture of justification and culture of authority 111
Division of labor and "black holes" 113
The meaning of rights 118
The role of text and interpretation 119
Finality and the limits of reason 120
Pluralist versus substantive/deliberative democracy 121
The historical roots of the culture of justification 122
The impact of legal culture on balancing and proportionality 126
The administratization of constitutional law 129

7 **The effects of proportionality** 133
"Race to the top" 134
The German baggage of proportionality 136
Canada 139
Israel 142
Canada and Israel: foreign law citation 146
Common law baggage? Some objections 148
Proportionality's doctrinal imperialism 150

Conclusion 153
Index 159